# GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF NORTH CAROLINA SESSION 2021

H.B. 724 Apr 28, 2021 HOUSE PRINCIPAL CLERK

HOUSE BILL DRH10282-ML-10

Repeal Death Penalty.

(Public)

Sponsors: Representative Alston.

Referred to:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

272829

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

Short Title:

H

#### A BILL TO BE ENTITLED

AN ACT TO REPEAL THE DEATH PENALTY AND TO PROVIDE THAT ALL CURRENT PRISONERS SENTENCED TO DEATH SHALL BE RESENTENCED TO LIFE IMPRISONMENT WITHOUT THE POSSIBILITY OF PAROLE.

Whereas, 10 people in North Carolina that were sentenced to death row have been found innocent of the crime for which they were sentenced; and

Whereas, evidence suggests a greater likelihood of wrongful conviction in death penalty cases; and

Whereas, the death penalty continues to be disproportionately imposed on members of minority groups, persons of low income, and persons with mental and intellectual disabilities; and

Whereas, studies have shown that the death penalty does not deter crime; and

Whereas, North Carolina spends almost eleven million dollars (\$11,000,000) annually on costs related to the death penalty, even though the last person executed in North Carolina was in 2006; and

Whereas, death penalty cases cost taxpayers approximately four times as much as non-death penalty cases; and

Whereas, arbitrary distinctions are made about whom to seek the death penalty against, and those decisions are often influenced by extra-legal factors; and

Whereas, Justices William Brennan and Thurgood Marshall of the United States Supreme Court both found that the death penalty was inherently unconstitutional as a violation of the Eighth Amendment to the United States Constitution; Now, therefore,

The General Assembly of North Carolina enacts:

SECTION 1. G.S. 7A-450(b1) is repealed.

**SECTION 2.** G.S. 7A-498.8(b)(5) reads as rewritten:

"(b) The appellate defender shall perform such duties as may be directed by the Office of Indigent Defense Services, including:

(5) Recruiting qualified members of the private bar who are willing to provide representation in State and federal death penalty postconviction proceedings."

**SECTION 3.** G.S. 14-7.2 reads as rewritten:

#### "§ 14-7.2. Punishment.

When any person is charged by indictment with the commission of a felony under the laws of the State of North Carolina and is also charged with being an habitual felon as defined in G.S. 14-7.1, he must, upon conviction, be sentenced and punished as an habitual felon, as in this Chapter provided, except in those cases where the death penalty or a life sentence is imposed."



D

**SECTION 4.** G.S. 14-7.8 reads as rewritten:

#### "§ 14-7.8. Punishment.

When a person is charged by indictment with the commission of a violent felony and is also charged with being a violent habitual felon as defined in G.S. 14-7.7, the person must, upon conviction, be sentenced in accordance with this Article, except in those cases where the death penalty is imposed. Article."

**SECTION 5.** G.S. 14-7.12 reads as rewritten:

#### "§ 14-7.12. Sentencing of violent habitual felons.

A person who is convicted of a violent felony and of being a violent habitual felon must, upon conviction (except where the death penalty is imposed), conviction, be sentenced to life imprisonment without parole. Life imprisonment without parole means that the person will spend the remainder of the person's natural life in prison. The sentencing judge may not suspend the sentence and may not place the person sentenced on probation. Sentences for violent habitual felons imposed under this Article shall run consecutively with and shall commence at the expiration of any other sentence being served by the person."

#### **SECTION 6.** G.S. 14-17(a) reads as rewritten:

"(a) A murder which shall be perpetrated by means of a nuclear, biological, or chemical weapon of mass destruction as defined in G.S. 14-288.21, poison, lying in wait, imprisonment, starving, torture, or by any other kind of willful, deliberate, and premeditated killing, or which shall be committed in the perpetration or attempted perpetration of any arson, rape or a sex offense, robbery, kidnapping, burglary, or other felony committed or attempted with the use of a deadly weapon shall be deemed to be murder in the first degree, a Class A felony, and any person who commits such murder shall be punished with death or imprisonment in the State's prison for life without parole as the court shall determine pursuant to G.S. 15A-2000, except that any such person who was under 18 years of age at the time of the murder shall be punished in accordance with Part 2A of Article 81B of Chapter 15A of the General Statutes."

**SECTION 7.** G.S. 15-176.1 is repealed.

**SECTION 8.** Article 17A and Article 19 of Chapter 15 of the General Statutes are repealed.

#### **SECTION 9.** G.S. 15A-268(a6) reads as rewritten:

- "(a6) The evidence described by subsection (a1) of this section shall be preserved for the following period:
  - (1) For conviction resulting in a sentence of death, until execution.
  - (2) For conviction resulting in a sentence of life without parole, until the death of the convicted person.
  - (3) For conviction of any homicide, sex offense, assault, kidnapping, burglary, robbery, arson or burning, for which a Class B1-E felony punishment is imposed, the evidence shall be preserved during the period of incarceration and mandatory supervised release, including sex offender registration pursuant to Article 27A of Chapter 14 of the General Statutes, except in cases where the person convicted entered and was convicted on a plea of guilty, in which case the evidence shall be preserved for the earlier of three years from the date of conviction or until released.
  - (4) Biological evidence collected as part of a criminal investigation of any homicide or rape, in which no charges are filed, shall be preserved for the period of time that the crime remains unsolved.
  - (5) A custodial agency in custody of biological evidence unrelated to a criminal investigation or prosecution referenced by subdivision (1), (2), (3), or (4) of this subsection may dispose of the evidence in accordance with the rules of the agency.

Page 2 DRH10282-ML-10

(6) Notwithstanding the retention requirements in subdivisions (1) through (5) of this subsection, at any time after collection and prior to or at the time of disposition of the case at the trial court level, if the evidence collected as part of the criminal investigation is of a size, bulk, or physical character as to render retention impracticable or should be returned to its rightful owner, the State may petition the court for retention of samples of the biological evidence in lieu of the actual physical evidence. After giving any defendant charged in connection with the case an opportunity to be heard, the court may order that the collecting agency take reasonable measures to remove or preserve for retention portions of evidence likely to contain biological evidence related to the offense through cuttings, swabs, or other means consistent with Crime Laboratory minimum guidelines in a quantity sufficient to permit DNA testing before returning or disposing of the evidence."

**SECTION 10.** G.S. 15A-734 reads as rewritten:

#### "§ 15A-734. Arrest without a warrant.

The arrest of a person may be lawfully made also by any peace officer or a private person, without a warrant, upon reasonable information that the accused stands charged in the courts of a state with a crime punishable by death or imprisonment for a term exceeding one year, but when so arrested the accused must be taken before a judge or magistrate with all practicable speed, and complaint must be made against him under oath setting forth the ground for the arrest as in G.S. 15A-733; and thereafter his answer shall be heard as if he had been arrested on a warrant."

**SECTION 11.** G.S. 15A-736 reads as rewritten:

#### "§ 15A-736. Bail in certain cases; conditions of bond.

Unless the offense with which the prisoner is charged is shown to be an offense punishable by death or life imprisonment under the laws of the state in which it was committed, a judge or magistrate in this State may admit the person arrested to bail by bond, with sufficient sureties, and in such sum as he deems proper, conditioned for his appearance before him at a time specified in such bond, and for his surrender, to be arrested upon the warrant of the Governor of this State."

## **SECTION 12.** G.S. 15A-1201(b) reads as rewritten:

"(b) Waiver of Right to Jury Trial. – A defendant accused of any criminal offense for which the State is not seeking a sentence of death in superior court may, knowingly and voluntarily, in writing or on the record in the court and with the consent of the trial judge, waive the right to trial by jury. When a defendant waives the right to trial by jury under this section, the jury is dispensed with as provided by law, and the whole matter of law and fact, to include all factors referred to in G.S. 20-179 and subsections (a1) and (a3) of G.S. 15A-1340.16, shall be heard and judgment given by the court. If a motion for joinder of co-defendants is allowed, there shall be a jury trial unless all defendants waive the right to trial by jury, or the court, in its discretion, severs the case."

**SECTION 13.** Part 2 of Article 81B of Chapter 15A of the General Statutes is amended by adding a new section to read:

# "§ 15A-1340.13A. Death penalty abolished.

Notwithstanding any other provision of law, no crime shall be punishable by death."

## **SECTION 14.** G.S. 15A-1340.17(c) reads as rewritten:

- "(c) Punishments for Each Class of Offense and Prior Record Level; Punishment Chart Described. The authorized punishment for each class of offense and prior record level is as specified in the chart below. Prior record levels are indicated by the Roman numerals placed horizontally on the top of the chart. Classes of offense are indicated by the letters placed vertically on the left side of the chart. Each cell on the chart contains the following components:
  - (1) A sentence disposition or dispositions: "C" indicates that a community punishment is authorized; "I" indicates that an intermediate punishment is

DRH10282-ML-10 Page 3

authorized; "A" indicates that an active punishment is authorized; and "Life Imprisonment Without Parole" indicates that the defendant shall be imprisoned for the remainder of the prisoner's natural life.

A presumptive range of minimum durations if the sentence of imprisonment

- (2) A presumptive range of minimum durations, if the sentence of imprisonment is neither aggravated or mitigated; any minimum term of imprisonment in that range is permitted unless the court finds pursuant to G.S. 15A-1340.16 that an aggravated or mitigated sentence is appropriate. The presumptive range is the middle of the three ranges in the cell.
- (3) A mitigated range of minimum durations if the court finds pursuant to G.S. 15A-1340.16 that a mitigated sentence of imprisonment is justified; in such a case, any minimum term of imprisonment in the mitigated range is permitted. The mitigated range is the lower of the three ranges in the cell.

(4) An aggravated range of minimum durations if the court finds pursuant to G.S. 15A-1340.16 that an aggravated sentence of imprisonment is justified; in such a case, any minimum term of imprisonment in the aggravated range is permitted. The aggravated range is the higher of the three ranges in the cell.

PRIOR RECORD LEVEL

	I	II	III	IV	V	VI			
	0-1 Pt	2-5 Pts	6-9 Pts	10-13 Pts	14-17 Pts	18+ Pts			
A	Life Imprisonment With Parole or Without Parole, or Death, as Established by Statute								
	A	A	A	A	A	A	DISPOSITION		
	240-300	276-345	317-397	365-456	Life Impris		Aggravated		
	Without Parole								
<b>B</b> 1	192-240	221-276	254-317	292-365	336-420	386-483	PRESUMPTIVE		
	144-192	166-221	190-254	219-292	252-336	290-386	Mitigated		
	A	A	A	A	A	A	DISPOSITION		
	157-196	180-225	207-258	238-297	273-342	314-393	Aggravated		
B2	125-157	144-180	165-207	190-238	219-273	251-314	PRESUMPTIVE		
	94-125	108-144	124-165	143-190	164-219	189-251	Mitigated		
	A	A	A	A	A	A	DISPOSITION		
	73-92	83-104	96-120	110-138	127-159	146-182	Aggravated		
C	58-73	67-83	77-96	88-110	101-127	117-146	PRESUMPTIVE		
	44-58	50-67	58-77	66-88	76-101	87-117	Mitigated		
	A	A	A	A	A	A	DISPOSITION		
	64-80	73-92	84-105	97-121	111-139	128-160	Aggravated		
D	51-64	59-73	67-84	78-97	89-111	103-128	PRESUMPTIVE		
	38-51	44-59	51-67	58-78	67-89	77-103	Mitigated		
	I/A	I/A	A	A	A	A	DISPOSITION		
	25-31	29-36	33-41	38-48	44-55	50-63	Aggravated		
E	20-25	23-29	26-33	30-38	35-44	40-50	PRESUMPTIVE		
	15-20	17-23	20-26	23-30	26-35	30-40	Mitigated		
	I/A	I/A	I/A	A	A	A	DISPOSITION		
	16-20	19-23	21-27	25-31	28-36	33-41	Aggravated		
F	13-16	15-19	17-21	20-25	23-28	26-33	PRESUMPTIVE		
	10-13	11-15	13-17	15-20	17-23	20-26	Mitigated		
	I/A	I/A	I/A	I/A	A	A	DISPOSITION		
	13-16	14-18	17-21	19-24	22-27	25-31	Aggravated		
G	10-13	12-14	13-17	15-19	17-22	20-25	PRESUMPTIVE		
	8-10	9-12	10-13	11-15	13-17	15-20	Mitigated		

Page 4 DRH10282-ML-10

Ger	neral Asser	Session 2021					
	C/I/A	I/A	I/A	I/A	I/A	A	DISPOSITION
	6-8	8-10	10-12	11-14	15-19	20-25	Aggravated
Н	5-6	6-8	8-10	9-11	12-15	16-20	PRESUMPTIVE
	4-5	4-6	6-8	7-9	9-12	12-16	Mitigated
	С	C/I	I	I/A	I/A	I/A	DISPOSITION
	6-8	6-8	6-8	8-10	9-11	10-12	Aggravated
I	4-6	4-6	5-6	6-8	7-9	8-10	PRESUMPTIVE
	3-4	3-4	4-5	4-6	5-7	6-8	Mitigated"

**SECTION 15.** G.S. 15A-1415 reads as rewritten:

# "§ 15A-1415. Grounds for appropriate relief which may be asserted by defendant after verdict; limitation as to time.

- (a) At any time after verdict, a noncapital defendant by motion may seek appropriate relief upon any of the grounds enumerated in this section. In a capital case, a postconviction motion for appropriate relief shall be filed within 120 days from the latest of the following:
  - (1) The court's judgment has been filed, but the defendant failed to perfect a timely appeal;
  - (2) The mandate issued by a court of the appellate division on direct appeal pursuant to N.C.R. App. P. 32(b) and the time for filing a petition for writ of certiorari to the United States Supreme Court has expired without a petition being filed;
  - (3) The United States Supreme Court denied a timely petition for writ of certiorari of the decision on direct appeal by the Supreme Court of North Carolina;
  - (4) Following the denial of discretionary review by the Supreme Court of North Carolina, the United States Supreme Court denied a timely petition for writ of certiorari seeking review of the decision on direct appeal by the North Carolina Court of Appeals;
  - (5) The United States Supreme Court granted the defendant's or the State's timely petition for writ of certiorari of the decision on direct appeal by the Supreme Court of North Carolina or North Carolina Court of Appeals, but subsequently left the defendant's conviction and sentence undisturbed; or
  - (6) The appointment of postconviction counsel for an indigent capital defendant.

(c) Notwithstanding the time limitations herein, a defendant at any time after verdict may by a motion for appropriate relief, raise the ground that evidence is available which was unknown or unavailable to the defendant at the time of trial, which could not with due diligence have been discovered or made available at that time, including recanted testimony, and which has a direct and material bearing upon the defendant's eligibility for the death penalty or the defendant's guilt or innocence. A motion based upon such newly discovered evidence must be filed within a reasonable time of its discovery.

...."

## **SECTION 16.** G.S. 15A-1419(e) reads as rewritten:

- "(e) For the purposes of subsection (b) of this section, a fundamental miscarriage of justice only results if:
  - (1) The defendant establishes that more likely than not, but for the error, no reasonable fact finder would have found the defendant guilty of the underlying offense; or offense.
  - (2) The defendant establishes by clear and convincing evidence that, but for the error, no reasonable fact finder would have found the defendant eligible for the death penalty.

Page 5

A defendant raising a claim of newly discovered evidence of factual innocence or ineligibility for the death penalty, otherwise barred by the provisions of subsection (a) of this section or

DRH10282-ML-10

G.S. 15A-1415(c), may only show a fundamental miscarriage of justice by proving by clear and convincing evidence that, in light of the new evidence, if credible, no reasonable juror would have found the defendant guilty beyond a reasonable doubt or eligible for the death penalty."

**SECTION 17.** Subchapter XV of Chapter 15A of the General Statutes is repealed. **SECTION 18.** G.S. 90-1.1(5) reads as rewritten:

- "(5) The practice of medicine or surgery. Except as otherwise provided by this subdivision, the practice of medicine or surgery, for purposes of this Article, includes any of the following acts:

 a. Advertising, holding out to the public, or representing in any manner that the individual is authorized to practice medicine in this State.

b. Offering or undertaking to prescribe, order, give, or administer any drug or medicine for the use of any other individual.

 c. Offering or undertaking to prevent or diagnose, correct, prescribe for, administer to, or treat in any manner or by any means, methods, or devices any disease, illness, pain, wound, fracture, infirmity, defect, or abnormal physical or mental condition of any individual, including the management of pregnancy or parturition.

d. Offering or undertaking to perform any surgical operation on any individual.

e. Using the designation "Doctor," "Doctor of Medicine," "Doctor of Osteopathy," "Doctor of Osteopathic Medicine," "Physician," "Surgeon," "Physician and Surgeon," "Dr.," "M.D.," "D.O.," or any combination thereof in the conduct of any occupation or profession pertaining to the prevention, diagnosis, or treatment of human disease or condition, unless the designation additionally contains the description of or reference to another branch of the healing arts for which the individual holds a valid license in this State or the use of the designation "Doctor" or "Physician" is otherwise specifically permitted by law.

f. The performance of any act, within or without this State, described in this subdivision by use of any electronic or other means, including the Internet or telephone.

The administration of required lethal substances or any assistance whatsoever rendered with an execution under Article 19 of Chapter 15 of the General Statutes does not constitute the practice of medicine or surgery."

## **SECTION 19.** G.S. 90-85.38(b) reads as rewritten:

"(b) The Board, in accordance with Chapter 150B of the General Statutes, may suspend, revoke, or refuse to grant or renew any permit for the same conduct as stated in subsection (a). The administration of required lethal substances or any assistance whatsoever rendered with an execution under Article 19 of Chapter 15 of the General Statutes does not constitute the practice of pharmacy under this Article, and any assistance rendered with an execution under Article 19 of Chapter 15 of the General Statutes shall not be the cause for disciplinary action under this Article."

# **SECTION 20.** G.S. 90-171.20(4) reads as rewritten:

"(4) "Nursing" is a dynamic discipline which includes the assessing, caring, counseling, teaching, referring and implementing of prescribed treatment in the maintenance of health, prevention and management of illness, injury, disability or the achievement of a dignified death. It is ministering to; assisting; and sustained, vigilant, and continuous care of those acutely or chronically ill; supervising patients during convalescence and rehabilitation; the supportive and restorative care given to maintain the optimum health level

Page 6 DRH10282-ML-10

1

of individuals, groups, and communities; the supervision, teaching, and evaluation of those who perform or are preparing to perform these functions; and the administration of nursing programs and nursing services. For purposes of this Article, the administration of required lethal substances or any assistance whatsoever rendered with an execution under Article 19 of Chapter 15 of the General Statutes does not constitute nursing."

10

**SECTION 21.** The Attorney General shall, on behalf of each person convicted of a capital offense and sentenced to death on or before the effective date of this section, petition the court in which the person was convicted to resentence the person pursuant to this section. Upon hearing the petition, the court shall order that the death sentence imposed by the judgment be vacated and the defendant resentenced to life imprisonment without the possibility of parole.

11 12 13

**SECTION 22.** This act is effective when it becomes law and applies to any person sentenced to death before, on, or after that date.

DRH10282-ML-10 Page 7